

**13th Meeting of the
Science Steering and Evaluation Panel
Nov 16-18, 2009
Alan Gilbert Building, The University of Melbourne,
Melbourne, Australia**

Draft Minutes Version 1.1

1. Joint Session, Introduction

1.1. Call to Order (SSEP co-chair Marta Torres)

SSEP co-chair Torres welcomed participants, thanked local host Gallagher, and briefly reviewed the meeting agenda and described how the meeting would be organized. Furthermore, Torres announced that the meeting would take three days, with required reviews for 17 drilling proposals (2 with external reviews). Torres reminded participants to speak slowly & clearly, to be sensitive to cultural and style differences, and that only one person would speak at a time (through the co-chairs), and that cross talk should be avoided.

1.2. Self-introduction of panel members, liaisons, and guests

Panel members:

Ivano Aiello (alt. for Marsaglia), Serge Berné, Hendrik Brinkhuis (co-chair), Julie Carlut, Beth Christensen (alt. for McHugh), Tim Ferdelman (alt. for MacLennan), Stephen Gallagher (local host), Robert Harris, Kai-Uwe Hinrichs, Matthew Hornbach, Ken Ikehara, Fumio Inagaki, Iryu Yasufumi, Akira Ishiwatari (co-chair), Achim Kopf, Junichiro Kuroda, Kyung Eun Lee, Tiegang Li, Katsuyuki Michibayashi, Katharina Pahnke, Heiko Pälike, Marcel Regelous (alt. for Brunelli), Yair Rosenthal, Tokiyuki Sato, Mitch Schulte, Aleksey Smirnov, Yohey Suzuki, Eiichi Takazawa, Marta Torres (co-chair), Peter Vrolijk, Kosei Yamaguchi

Panel members not able to attend:

Daniele Brunelli, John MacLennan, Kathleen Marsaglia, Cecilia McHugh, Xuelin Qiu (no alternate)

Liaisons and observers:

Carlos Alvarez-Zarikian (USIO), Louise Anderson (ESO), Charna Meth (Ocean Leadership), Helen Evans (USIO), Neville Exon (ANZIC), Joerg Geldmacher (USIO), Stuart Henrys (SSP), Junzo Kasahara (SPC), Hiroshi Kawamura (IODP-MI), Yusuke Kubo (CDEX), Takashi Nakagawa (MEXT), Ian MacGregor (IODP-MI 2nd Triennium Review Committee), Simon Nielsen (CDEX), John Tauxe (EDP), Barry Zelt (IODP-MI)

1.3. Welcome and meeting logistics (host Stephen Gallagher)

Local host ANZIC SSEP member Gallagher welcomed delegates, explained logistics, and provided apologies for missing nametags. The SSEP thanked him for organizing the meeting and for guiding a much appreciated field trip “*The Geology of the Surf Coast south of Melbourne*” prior to the SSEP meeting on Nov 15th, introducing participants to aspects of the Eocene to Miocene geology in the region.

1.4. Approval of present 13th SSEP meeting agenda (Torres)

SSEP Consensus 0911-1: The SSEP approves the revised agenda of their 13th meeting, Nov 16-18, 2009 in Melbourne, Australia.

The agenda for the 13th meeting of SSEP is provided as **Attachment 1**.

1.5. Approval of last (12th) SSEP meeting minutes (Torres)

Torres asks for approval of the most recent 12th SSEP meeting in Utrecht, The Netherlands (May 2009). Torres asked for a consensus to approve the minutes ‘as is’, and all members agreed.

SSEP Consensus 0911-2: The SSEP approves the minutes of their 12th SSEP meeting on May 25-28th 2009, Utrecht, The Netherlands.

1.6 IODP-MI Report (Kawamura)

Hiroshi Kawamura (Science Support, IODP-MI, Sapporo Office) reported on activities at IODP-MI. He provided information about the IODP organizational structure, and gave an overview of the current Science Advisory Structure (SAS) meeting schedule. He then provided proposal submission statistics. For this SSEP meeting, IODP-MI received 15 proposals (5 environment, 2 solid earth, 8 microbiology and sub-seafloor). As of 4 November 2009, 106 proposals were active in the system (37 solid earth, 44 environment, 25 deep biosphere). For the current SSEP meeting there would be 5 full proposals, 7 pre-proposals, 3 ancillary proposal letters (APL), as well as 2 proposals with external reviews. Following an extensive review of all proposal statistics, Kawamura explained the potential outcomes and recommendations for each proposal type for the current meeting. He mentioned that Engineering Manager Greg Myers was leaving IODP-MI, mentioned current IODP-MI vacancies, and then concluded with a reminder of the current SSEP member rotation schedule.

1.7. SAS Panel Reports

1.7.1. SPC Report (Kasahara)

SPC chair Kasahara gave an update on the most recent August 2009 SPC meeting in Kiel, Germany. Important elements included that the SPC received the IWG+ guidance for INVEST and endorses all elements of the guiding principles. The SPC recommends that discussions of post-2013 scientific ocean drilling should incorporate: (1) more seamless integration with other major geoscience programs (e.g., ocean observatories, ICDP, ANDRILL), as appropriate; (2) further recognition of the importance of onshore to offshore transects for some types of scientific studies; and (3) substantial flexibility in program and expedition planning and formulation. Further, the SPC commends the efforts of the “Flexible Expedition Implementation” Working Group (Filippelli, Ohkouchi, Peterson) to explore schemes at the proposal level and SPC level that would ensure achievement of top science objectives while allowing maximum implementation flexibility. In addition, The SPC approved the following *JOIDES Resolution* schedule for late FY2010 and FY2011: (1) Juan de Fuca Flank Hydrogeology

(Proposal 545-Full3) and Cascadia Accretionary Prism CORK (Proposal 734-APL); (2) South Pacific Gyre Microbiology (Proposal 662-Full3); (3) Louisville Seamounts (Proposal 636-Full3); (4) Superfast Spreading Crust (Proposal 552-Full5) + Costa Rica Seismogenesis Project (CRISP) Phase A (Proposal 537A-Full5); and (5) Mid-Atlantic Ridge Microbiology (Proposal 677-Full). Further, the SPC approved a five-month operational plan and contingencies for *Chikyu*, with starting date in FY2011 to be determined. Last but not least, the SPC appoints Hendrik (Henk) Brinkhuis as co-chair of the Science Steering and Evaluation Panel (SSEP), effective immediately

1.7.2. SSP Report (Site Survey Panel; Henrys)

Stuart Henrys (SSP liaison) explained the role of the SSP, and reported on the outcomes of most recent July 2009 SSP meeting in Austin, Texas, USA. Henrys listed two new SSP members, and provided updates on those proposals that the SSEP will evaluate during the meeting. Henrys announced that the next SSP meeting will be held in Wellington, New Zealand, in late January 2010.

1.7.3. EDP Report (Engineering Development Panel; Tauxe)

John Tauxe (EDP liaison) reviewed the role of EDP and updated the SSEP on EDP activities. He summarized current technological issues, including continuous core recovery high latitude coring activities. He then reviewed engineering and technical issues for upcoming proposals, which include SCIMPI and non-magnetic core barrels. The next EDP meeting will be held in Sendai, Japan in January 2010.

1.7.4. ESO Report (European Implementing Organization; Anderson)

Louise Anderson (Leicester) reported on current and future activities by the ECORD Science Operator. She reviewed the accomplishments of Expedition 313 (New Jersey) and discussed preparations for Expedition 325 (Great Barrier Reef Environmental Changes), scheduled for November-December 2009, with Jody Webster and Yusuke Yokoyama as co-chief scientists. She pointed to the high number of high ranked publications resulting from ESO/ECORD Expeditions.

1.7.5. USIO Report (United States Implementing Organization; Zarikian)

Carlos Zarikian (TAMU) reported on the *JOIDES Resolution* Expeditions and likely new schedule. He briefly reviewed the accomplishments of PEAT I and II, the Juan de Fuca CORK remedial cementing job, the Bering Sea, and the Shatsky Rise expeditions; all were very successful, and many problems apparent during the shakedown cruise (and PEAT I) were now under control. The Canterbury Basin Expedition 317 is just underway, and will be followed by the Wilkes Land Antarctica Expedition 318 early January. Sampling parties organized for PEAT, were equally successful. While the schedule following 318 is not formally set yet, Zarikian eluded to signals that industry work in collaboration with KIGAM and the Korean National Oil Company will now likely *not* follow the Wilkes Land Expedition. New expeditions (Juan de Fuca, Cascadia, South Pacific Gyre Microbiology, Louisville Seamounts, Superfast/CRISP, Mid-Atlantic

Microbiology) will be scheduled starting in June 2010, after a ‘non IODP phase’. Further, Zirikian provided an update on LDEO’ status through the recent expeditions, and outreach activities, including video reports of a ‘School of Rock’ session, with live interaction to and from the ship and scientists. He finished by announcing that Brad Clement is the new director of IODP-USIO-TAMU, as of August 3, 2009.

1.7.6. CDEX Report (Japan Implementing Organization; Nielsen)

Simon Nielsen (CDEX) provided an update on the current CDEX and *Chikyu* status. He not only confirmed that *Chikyu* azimuth thruster repairs are now working properly, he hailed the successful completion of the first riser drilling in IODP history. Activities of CDEX in 2009 included two IODP Expeditions in Stage 2 of the NanTroSEIZE Complex Drilling Project: Exp. 319 (May 10 – August 22) included the first riser operation in scientific ocean drilling. Expedition 322 (September 1 – October 10) targeted subduction input sites in the Shikoku Basin. These messages were followed by an overview of the tentative 2009-2010 schedule and outreach activities. Training cruises will be held in November and December 2009, training core techs on advanced piston-coring methods. Stage 3 will begin during the second half of 2010, with the initiation of the NanTroSEIZE deep riser drilling as well as installation of observatories at several NanTroSEIZE sites.

2. Reviewing process

2.1 Introduction

SSEP co-chair Marta Torres reviewed the SSEP terms of reference, and explained again the conflict of interest (COI) rules that had been circulated prior to the meeting. Torres reviewed the star grouping system, and reminded the panel that if an EDP and/or STP review was requested, a detailed justification will be added in the review.

2.1 Breakout Sessions

A total of 17 proposals were reviewed during the meeting, including new external reviews available for 2 proposals. Panel members were divided into two breakout sessions for detailed discussions of the proposals: Breakout Group 1: *Deep Biosphere/Microbiology* (chaired by M. Torres), Breakout Group 2: *Solid Earth/Paleoenvironments* (chaired by H. Brinkhuis and A. Ishiwatari);

Kopf asked the co-chairs about the reasoning behind the watchdog assignments for this meeting; he felt the assignments disregarded both expertise of individual panel members and continuity (i.e., lead watchdogs of a given proposal during the previous SSEP meeting were not assigned to the same proposal this time, not even as a non-lead watchdog). The co-chairs disagreed with Kopf’s statement that the assignments were done without regard to expertise. They recognized, however, that in some cases there was not a perfect match, and explained some of the difficulties in making assignments for the current meeting; in particular the large cadre of new members and last minute replacements. Nonetheless, in the future,

even more effort will be done to secure the best possible evaluation of proposals as SSEP member Kopf suggested.

The conflict of interest rules and confidentiality requirements were respected during the entire review procedure (breakout sessions, general sessions, and grouping). The table below lists the conflicted SSEP members, liaisons and guests who left the room during the review of the relevant proposals.

Breakout Group 1: Microbiology • Chair: Torres • Alan Gilbert-G21, Theatre 1

Proposal	Conflict	Lead WD	WD #2	WD #3	WD #4	WD #5
673-Full2		Inagaki	Iryu	Schulte	Vrolijk	Christensen
743-Full		Vrolijk	Kopf	Harris	Suzuki	Hornbach
755-Pre		Suzuki	Pahnke	Yamaguchi	Schulte	Rosenthal
758-Full		Kopf	Hinrichs	Felderman	Regelous	Yamaguchi
759-Pre		Yamaguchi	Hinrichs	Carlut	Inagaki	Takazawa
761-Pre	Hinrichs	Harris	Felderman	Hornbach	Suzuki	Vrolijk
762-APL		Schulte	Kopf	Hornbach	Hinrichs	Lee
764-Pre		Ikehara	Michibayashi	Inagaki	Regelous	Harris

Breakout Group 2: Solid Earth and Paleoenvironment • Co-chairs: Ishiwatari and Brinkhuis • Alan Gilbert-109, Theatre 2

Proposal	Conflict	Lead WD	WD #2	WD #3	WD #4	WD #5
672-Full3*	Ferdelman	Pälike	Ikehara	Berne	Rosenthal	Kuroda
708-Pre2	Brinkhuis	Aiello	Kuroda	Sato	Lee	Berne
735-Full		Takazawa	Michibayashi	Hornbach	Regelous	Carlut
754-Full		Ferdelman	Li	Takazawa	Smirnov	Michibayashi
748-Full*	Kopf	Carlut	Ikehara	Regelous	Aiello	Li
756-Pre		Berne	Sato	Christensen	Iryu	Smirnov
757-APL		Rosenthal	Lee	Pahnke	Palike	Sato
760-Pre		Li	Christensen	Palike	Smirnov	Pahnke
763-APL		Kuroda	Smirnov	Iryu	Gallagher	Aiello

* Proposals with new external reviews

3. Joint Session, Proposal Dispositions

The course of action regarding each of the 17 SSEP proposals reviewed during the Melbourne meeting was achieved by consensus of the full panel. The specific dispositions for each proposal were as follows:

Number	Short Title	Contact Proponent	Disposition
--------	-------------	-------------------	-------------

673-Full2	Morocco Margin Mud Mound	Van Rooij	Deactivate
708-Pre2	Central Arctic Paleoceanography	Stein	Develop Full
735-Full	South China Sea Tectonic Evolution	Li	Revise Full
743-Full	Gulf of Mexico Hydrate Dynamics	Knapp	Revise Full / Review by EDP/ Preview by EPSP
754-Full	Norwegian Sea Silica Diagenesis	Davies	Revise Full
755-Pre	Arctic Slope Stability	Winkelmann	Deactivate
756-Pre	Arctic Ocean Exit Gateway	Jakobsson	Develop Full
757-APL	South Pacific Eocene-Oligocene	Lyle	Forward to SPC
758-Full	Atlantis Massif Seafloor Processes	Frueh-Green	Revise Full Review by EDP
759-Pre	EPR Fast-Spread Crust	Haymon	Revise Pre
760-Pre	SW Australia Margin Cretaceous Climate	Grocke	Revise Pre
761-Pre	South Atlantic Bight Hydrogeology	Wilson	Develop Full
762-APL	Grizzly Bare Outcrop Microbiology	Wheat	Forward to SPC
763-APL	Iberian Margin Paleoclimate	Hodell	Forward to SPC
764-Pre	TAG II Hydrothermal System	Rona	Revise Pre
672-Full3*	Baltic Sea Basin Paleoenvironment	Andren	Forward to SPC w/3*
748-Full*	Nice Airport Landslide	Stegmann	Revise Full

* Proposals with new external reviews.

The summary dispositions were as follows:

Pre-Proposal: revise preliminary proposal	=	3
Pre-Proposal: develop full proposal	=	3
Full Proposal: forward to SPC	=	1 (Grouping: 3*)
Full Proposal: send for external review	=	0
APL: forward to SPC	=	3
Full Proposal: revise full proposal	=	5
Full Proposal: request new submission/deactivate	=	1
Pre Proposal: request new submission/deactivate	=	1
APL: request new submission/deactivate	=	0

The specific dispositions for each proposal were as follows:

A qualitative grouping was assigned to those proposals forwarded to the SPC using the 5-star scale grouping. Grouping was obtained by consensus of the full panel, after evaluation against the individual grouping criteria.

4. Nominations for new SSEP co-chair, to replace Akira Ishiwatari

Inagaki nominated Yasufumi Iryu, Sato seconded.

The nomination of Yasufumi Iryu was approved by vote of the full panel, using paper ballots (27 yes, 3 no, 1 abstain).

SSEP Consensus 0911-3: The SSEP recommends that SPC consider Yasufumi Iryu for appointment as the next Co-Chair of SSEP.

5. Next SSEP meetings

Fumio Inagaki presented the logistics and details for the next planned SSEP meeting in Kochi, Japan, May 18 (Tue) – 21 (Fri), 2010. A possible fieldtrip will occur on Monday, May 17th, 2010. The November 2010 meeting will be in the USA (possibly Portland).

6. Resolutions for outgoing SSEP members

Resolutions were given for outgoing SSEP members, viz: Junichiro Kuroda (by K. Ikehara), Eiichi Takazawa (by K. Michibayashi), Kosei Yamaguchi (by Y. Suzuki) and Heiko Pälike (by H. Brinkhuis).

7. Conclusion

The co-chairs Akira Ishiwatari, Marta Torres and Henk Brinkhuis thanked all of the panel members for their dedication and hard work, and again thanked Stephen Gallagher for hosting the meeting. Watchdogs submitted drafts of proposal reviews to the IODP-MI science coordinators (Hiroshi Kawamura and Barry Zelt) before the meeting ended.

APPENDIX 1:

13th Meeting of the Science Steering and Evaluation Panel
The Alan Gilbert Building, Grattan Street, The University of Melbourne
Melbourne, Australia, 16-18 November 2009

Approved agenda

Sunday, November 15 (Optional)

A trip to the world class outcrops of Eocene to Miocene volcanic and cool water carbonate exposures along the surf coast south of Melbourne. Leave Hotel 10.30am return *ca.* 5.00pm.

Welcoming Reception in Evening - 19:30-21:30 sponsored and hosted by Professor Glyn Davis (Vice Chancellor, the University of Melbourne) **at Graduate House, the University of Melbourne.**

Monday, 08:30-17:00 Nov 16, 2009 Alan Gilbert-109, Theatre 2

Joint Session, Reports

- Introduction of all meeting participants
- Opening remarks by host (Gallagher)
- Approval of the agenda (Torres)
- Approval of previous (May 2009 meeting) minutes (Torres)
- Introduction to the meeting (Torres)
- IODP-MI report (Kawamura)
- SPC report (Kasahara)
- SSP report (Stuart)
- USIO report (Zarikian)

----- *Coffee break* ----- *ca. 10.00am in the 1st floor Executive Lounge (ANZIC sponsored)*

- CDEX report (Kubo)
- ESO report (Anderson)
- EDP report (Tauxe)

----- *Lunch break* ----- *(not provided, Lygon Street is the place to go)*

Joint Session, Meeting overview

- Reviewing process, breakout sessions, conflict of interest, star system etc. (Torres)

----- *Coffee break* ----- *ca. 3.00pm in the 1st floor Executive Lounge (ANZIC sponsored)*

Breakout sessions

- Proposal review

Proposals to be reviewed:

Proposal	Short title	Lead proponent	Conflict of Int.
672-Full3*	Baltic Sea Basin Paleoenvironment	Andren	Ferdelman
673-Full2	Morocco Margin Mud Mound	Van Rooij	
708-Pre2	Central Arctic Paleoceanography	Stein	Brinkhuis
735-Full	South China Sea Tectonic Evolution	Li	
743-Full	Gulf of Mexico Hydrate Dynamics	Knapp	
754-Full	Norwegian Sea Silica Diagenesis	Davies	
748-Full*	Nice Airport Landslide	Stegmann	Kopf
755-Pre	Arctic Slope Stability	Winkelmann	
756-Pre	Arctic Ocean Exit Gateway	Jakobsson	
757-APL	South Pacific Eocene-Oligocene	Lyle	
758-Full	Atlantis Massif Seafloor Processes	Frueh-Green	
759-Pre	EPR Fast-Spread Crust	Haymon	
760-Pre	SW Australia Margin Cretaceous Climate	Grocke	
761-Pre	South Atlantic Bight Hydrogeology	Wilson	Hinrichs
762-APL	Grizzly Bare Outcrop Microbiology	Wheat	
763-APL	Iberian Margin Paleoclimate	Hodell	
764-Pre	TAG II Hydrothermal System	Rona	

* Proposals with new external reviews

Watchdog assignments:

Breakout Group 1: Microbiology • Chair: Torres • *Alan Gilbert-G21, Theatre 1*

Proposal	Lead WD	WD #2	WD #3	WD #4	WD #5
673-Full2	Inagaki	Iryu	Schulte	Vrolijk	Christensen
743-Full	Vrolijk	Kopf	Harris	Suzuki	Hornbach
755-Pre	Suzuki	Pahnke	Yamaguchi	Schulte	Rosenthal
758-Full	Kopf	Hinrichs	Ferdelman	Yamaguchi	Regelous
759-Pre	Yamaguchi	Hinrichs	Carlut	Inagaki	Takazawa
761-Pre	Harris	Ferdelman	Hornbach	Suzuki	Vrolijk
762-APL	Schulte	Kopf	Hornbach	Hinrichs	Lee
764-Pre	Ikehara	Michibayashi	Inagaki	Regelous	Harris

Breakout Group 2: Solid Earth and Paleoenvironment • Co-chairs: Ishiwatari and Brinkhuis • *Alan Gilbert-109, Theatre 2*

Proposal	Lead WD	WD #2	WD #3	WD #4	WD #5
672-Full3	Palike	Ikehara	Berne	Rosenthal	Kuroda
708-Pre2	Aiello	Kuroda	Sato	Lee	Berne
735-Full	Takazawa	Michibayashi	Hornbach	Regelous	Carlut
754-Full	Ferdelman	Li	Takazawa	Michibayashi	Smirnov
748-Full	Carlut	Ikehara	Regelous	Aiello	Li
756-Pre	Berne	Sato	Christensen	Iryu	Smirnov
757-APL	Rosenthal	Lee	Pahnke	Palike	Sato
760-Pre	Li	Christensen	Palike	Smirnov	Pahnke
763-APL	Kuroda	Smirnov	Iryu	Gallagher	Aiello

* Proposals with new external reviews

Tuesday, 08:30-17:00 Nov 17, 2009

Breakout sessions

- Proposal review cont.

----- *Coffee break* ----- ca. 10.00am in the 1st floor Executive Lounge (ANZIC sponsored)

Breakout sessions

- Proposal review cont.

----- *Lunch break* ----- 12.00 midday, catered for in the 1st floor Executive Lounge (ANZIC sponsored)

Joint SSEP session Alan Gilbert-109, Theatre 2

- Proposal Review

----- *Coffee break* ----- 3.00pm in the 1st floor Executive Lounge (ANZIC sponsored)

Joint SSEP session Alan Gilbert-109, Theatre 2

- Proposal Review

7.00pm - **Meeting Dinner** (part sponsored by Esso Australia Ltd.- includes 3 course meal with beer, wine & soft drinks - cost is now ca. 50 AUD per person) – **at University House, the University of Melbourne.**

Wednesday, 08:30-17:00 Nov 18, 2009

Joint SSEP session Alan Gilbert-109, Theatre 2

- Proposal Review

----- *Coffee break* ----- *ca. 10.00am, outside Theatre 2 (ANZIC sponsored)*

Joint SSEP session Alan Gilbert-109, Theatre 2

-Proposal Review

----- *Lunch break* ----- *12.00 midday, catered for outside Theatre 2 (ANZIC sponsored)*

Joint SSEP session Alan Gilbert-109, Theatre 2

-Discussions and recommendations to SPC

-Nomination of new co-chair (replacing Ishiwatari)

-Other business

-Announcements on upcoming SSEP Meetings; May 2010 (Japan) & Nov 2010 (USA)

-Resolutions for outgoing SSEP; Junichiro Kuroda (by K. Ikehara), Eiichi Takazawa (by K. Michibayashi), Kosei Yamaguchi (by Y. Suzuki) and Heiko Pälke (by H. Brinkhuis)

-Conclusions