

JR Facility Science Evaluation Panel (SEP) Meeting 23-26 June 2014
Heldrich Hotel, New Brunswick, NJ USA

Science Subgroup

Jang-Jun Bahk	Korea Institute of Geoscience & Mineral Resources (KIGAM)
Jan-Hinrich Behrmann ¹	Helmholtz Centre for Ocean Research Kiel (GEOMAR)
Timothy Bralower	Pennsylvania State University
Zanna Chase ²	University of Tasmania
Beth Christensen	Adelphi University
Peter Clift	Louisiana State University
Adélie Delacour	University Jean Monnet Saint-Etienne
Heitor Evangelista	University of the State of Rio de Janeiro
Verena Heuer	University of Bremen
Steve Hovan	Indiana University of Pennsylvania
Minoru Ikehara	Kochi University
Benoit Ildefonse ³	CNRS Montpellier
Satoko Ishimaru	Kumamoto University
Samuel Jaccard ⁴	University of Bern
Anthony Koppers ⁵	Oregon State University
Dick Kroon	University of Edinburgh (SEP Co-Chair)
Lisa McNeill	University of Southampton
Ken Miller	Rutgers The State University of New Jersey
Tomoaki Morishita	Kanazawa University
Clive Neal	University of Notre Dame
Koichiro Obana	Japan Agency for Marine-Earth Science and Technology (JAMSTEC)
Vivian Pellizari	University of São Paulo
Brian Romans	Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University (Virginia Tech)
Amelia Shevenell	University of South Florida
Ashok Singhvi	Physical Research Laboratory
Weidong Sun	Guangzhou Institute of Geochemistry
Jason Sylvan	University of Southern California
Yoshinori Takano	JAMSTEC
John Tarduno	University of Rochester
Andreas Teske ⁶	University of North Carolina
Jun Tian	Tongji University
Bridget Wade ⁷	University College London
Yuhji Yamamoto ⁸	Kochi University

Unable to attend

¹ Alternate for Jörg Geldmacher (ECORD)

² Alternate for Jody Webster (ANZIC)

³ Alternate for Nabil Sultan (ECORD)

⁴ Alternate for Matt O'Regan (ECORD)

⁵ Alternate for Eric Ferre (US)

⁶ Alternate for Jennifer Biddle (US)

⁷ Alternate for Stuart Robinson (ECORD)

⁸ Alternate for Yusuke Yokoyama (Japan)

Site Subgroup

James Austin	University of Texas at Austin
Serge Berne	Universite de Perpignan Via Domitia
Cara Burberry	University of Nebraska - Lincoln
Tadeu dos Reis	State University of Rio de Janeiro
Andrew Gorman ⁹	University of Otago
Sean Gulick ¹⁰	University of Texas at Austin
Matt Hornbach ¹¹	Southern Methodist University
Mads Huuse	University of Manchester
Ken Ikehara	National Institute of Advanced Industrial Science and Technology
Priyank Jaiswal ¹²	Oklahoma State University
Dae Choul Kim	Pukyong National University
Sebastian Krastel	Christian-Albrechts University at Kiel
Jiabiao Li	Second Institute of Oceanography
David Mallinson	East Carolina University (SEP Co-Chair)
Neil Mitchell ¹³	University of Manchester
Dhananjai Pandey	National Center for Antarctic and Ocean Research
Robert Pockalny	University of Rhode Island
Derek Sawyer	Ohio State University
Cleverson Silva	Federal Fluminense University
Zhen Sun	South China Sea Institute of Oceanology
Gabriele Uenzelmann-Neben	Alfred Wegner Institute

Liaisons and Observers

Jamie Allan	National Science Foundation (NSF)
Rita Bauer	IODP Science Support Office (SSO) - UCSD/SIO
Keir Becker	IODP Forum Chair - University of Miami
David Divins	US Implementing Organization (USIO) – Consortium for Ocean Leadership
Nobu Eguchi	JAMSTEC Center for Deep Earth Exploration (CDEX)
Katie Fillingham	US Science Support Program (USSSP) – Consortium for Ocean Leadership
Karsten Gohl	European Consortium for Ocean Research Drilling (ECORD) Facility Board (Chair)
Dave Goldberg	USIO – Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory (LDEO)
Susan Humphris	JOIDES Resolution Facility Board Chair - Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution
Tom Janecek	NSF
Yuzuru Kimura	Japan Ministry of Education (MEXT)
Adam Klaus	USIO – Texas A&M University (TAMU)
Denise Kulhanek	USIO - TAMU
Leah Levay	USIO - TAMU
Mitch Malone	USIO - TAMU
Dave McInroy	ECORD Science Office (ESO) - British Geological Survey

Unable to attend

⁹ Alternate for Ben Clennell (ANZIC)

¹⁰ Site Alternate for Kathie Marsaglia – Science (US)

¹¹ Alternate for Roger Flood (US)

¹² Alternate for Andrew Goodliffe (US)

¹³ Alternate for Dave Mosher (ECORD)

Liaisons and Observers (cont.)

Charna Meth	USSSP – Consortium for Ocean Leadership
Sally Morgan	LDEO
Yuki Morono	JAMSTEC
Jae-Ho Oh	KIGAM
Angela Slagle	USIO - TAMU
Meagan Thompson	NSF
Michiko Yamamoto	IODP SSO - UCSD/SIO

1. Welcome and Introductions

Dick Edwards, Chancellor of Rutgers, and Ken Miller, Rutgers SEP host, welcomed the SEP, Liaisons, and Observers to New Brunswick and provided a brief history of Rutgers and the history and geology of the New Brunswick area.

1.1 Call to Order and Self-Introductions

SEP Co-Chair, Dick Kroon, called the meeting to order and asked attendees to perform self-introductions.

1.2 Logistical Announcements

Rita Bauer (IODP SSO Project Coordinator) and K. Miller reviewed basic logistics for the meeting.

1.3 Approval of Meeting Agenda

Kroon reviewed the agenda and its implementation over the 4-day meeting. He introduced changes to the process that were based on panel member recommended improvements. K. Miller moved to approve the agenda and Kier Becker seconded. The panel approved the agenda.

2. Reports from IODP Entities

2.1 FORUM Report

Keir Becker, FORUM Chair, presented a summary of the results of the 27-28 May 2014 Forum Meeting in Busan, Korea. This included:

- Minor changes to the FORUM's Terms of Reference
- A summary of progress toward the New Science Plan
- Mid-Term Renewals - Agency and/or Country Representative Statements
- Next Forum meeting will be July 8-10, 2015 at Australian National University – Host, Neville Exon
- Recommendations for collaboration with the International Continental Drilling Program (ICDP)
- Consensus and Action Items

Becker noted that China expressed interest in becoming an International Ocean Discovery Program (IODP) Platform provider after 2018, but the FORUM meeting's Chinese attendee provided no additional/detailed information. Becker stated that China had interest in having a ship and that China could build or rent to accomplish this goal. More information is provided in Becker's powerpoint presentation, which is posted at <http://www.iodp.org/meeting-presentations?version=2>.

2.2 Perspectives from the JRFB Chair

Delayed until Tuesday 24 June to accommodate JRFB Chair Susan Humphris' schedule.

2.3 NSF Report and JR Facility Status

Jamie Allan stated that the NSF was close to finalizing a cooperative agreement with TAMU for the USIO, with a start date of July 1 as their goal. He reminded the team that NSF had posted a solicitation for the USSSP, is currently receiving responses, and they will assemble a proposal review panel later this summer.

Allan stated that the *JR*'s Yokohama port call was successful, with notable VIPs touring the ship; including US Ambassador to Japan, Caroline Kennedy. Allan thanked JAMSTEC for loaning joint string to the *JR* to assist in meeting the deep objective of the Izu Bonin Mariana (IBM) leg.

Allan announced that Rodey Batiza (former NSF IODP Program Manager) retired recently from NSF. He offered to forward on contact information of anyone interested in continuing communication with Rodey. On a sad note, Allan announced that Bruce Malfait, former Ocean Drilling Program (ODP) Program Manger, had died suddenly, and that Allan and Tom Janecek are working to arrange a memorial for him. They welcome your stories, etc. to write up something for the community.

2.4 *JR* Activities / Implementing Organization (IO) Report

Mitch Malone (Manager of Science Operations for USIO) presented a summary of updates including:

- Video images comparing the old subsea camera to the new subsea camera
- Expedition 349 South China Sea operations and highlights
- Expedition 350 IBM Rear Arc site-specific operations and lithostratigraphy
- Expedition 351 IBM Arc Origins operations
- *JR* Science Operator Update
- *JR* Schedule

More information is provided in Malone's powerpoint presentation, which is posted at <http://www.iodp.org/meeting-presentations?version=2>.

Malone asked for co-chief nominations for the 2015-2016 expeditions. Kroon states that this will be in agenda item 10 - AOB (all other business).

2.5 Mission-Specific Platforms / IO Report (ECORD/ESO)

David McInroy (ESO Science Manager) presented the ESO update on Mission Specific Platform (MSP) expeditions. The main ESO activities were:

- IODP Expedition 347: Onshore Science Party
- Expedition 347 Main Outcomes
- Global Distribution of MSP Proposals
 - March 2014 ECORD Facility Board (EFB) meeting motion summary
- IODP Expedition 357: Atlantis Massif Preparations
 - RSS *James Cook*
 - Final schedule to be confirmed (allocated Nov-Dec 2015)
 - Room for 32 scientists and technicians.
 - Project Timeline
- ESO FY14 Engineering Development
- EC Infrastructure Proposal (due 2 September 2014)
- Building the Research Infrastructure (RI): European Community Participation
- Technical Review of six of the seven proposals presented at the March 2014 ECORD meeting

More information is provided in McInroy's powerpoint presentation, which is posted at <http://www.iodp.org/meeting-presentations?version=2..>

Several panelists asked about the status of the MEBO 200 seafloor drilling rig. Karsten Gohl ECORD Chair, stated that the MEBO 200 test cruise is scheduled for October 2014 in the North Sea, noting that there are sea states where it cannot be deployed, but once deployed, the sea state threshold is higher for operation. He noted that it could experience weather-related downtime.

Gohl then presented the following highlights of the March 2014 ECORD Meeting:

- Scheduling of MSP Expeditions
 - Seven proposals were discussed; financial constraints demanded a long-term strategy
- What are the priorities for MSPs?
- Categorizing MSP Proposals
- Scheduling Strategy for MSPs
- MSP proposals at this SEP meeting include:
 - 548-Add4, Morgan, Chicxulub Crater
 - 708-Full, Stein, Arctic Paleoceanography
 - 730-Full, Taylor, Sabine Bank Sea Level
 - 852-Pre, Stewart, North Sea GlaciStore
 - 860-CPP, Levy, ANDRILL¹⁴ Coulman High Paleoclimate
 - 861-Pre, Balco, Antarctic Peninsula Thermochronometry
 - 863-MDP, Peterson, ISOLAT¹⁵ Southern Ocean Paleoclimate

Gohl asked the Watchdogs (WDs) for these proposals to contact him and get Gohl and McInroy involved in the WD discussions. More information is provided in Gohl's powerpoint presentation, which is posted at <http://www.iodp.org/meeting-presentations?version=2>.

2.6 *Chikyu* Activities/ IO Report

Nobu Eguchi (CDEX) presented updates of *Chikyu* activity and Operation Office status, including:

- JAMSTEC Executive Personnel
- JAMSTEC Organizational Structure - changes since April 1, 2014
- Strategic Research and Development (R&D) Area with specific Center for Ocean Drilling Science
- CDEX New Organization Chart - changes since April 1, 2014
- *Chikyu* IODP Board (CIB) Activity Summary
- JTRACK¹⁶ Workshop Summary
- Expedition 348 Plan (changes since January 2014)
- Expedition 348 Operational Summary
- JFY2014 *Chikyu* Schedule

More information is provided in Eguchi's powerpoint presentation posted at <http://www.iodp.org/meeting-presentations?version=2>.

¹⁴ Antarctic geological DRILLing

¹⁵ Integrated Southern Ocean Latitudinal Transects

¹⁶ Tracking Tsunamigenic Slips in the Japan Trench

3. Science Support Office Report

Michiko Yamamoto, IODP SSO Proposal Manager, presented a summary of active proposals and updates since the last SEP Meeting, including:

- Proposal submission statistics 2004-2014
- Distribution of Active Proposals by:
 - Science Plan Themes and Challenges
 - Target Ocean
 - Review Stage
 - Country per lead proponent member affiliation
 - Country per all proponents member affiliation
 - Drilling platforms
- PDB Development Plans
- Google Earth Drilled Holes overlay
- Meeting Schedules 2014 vs. 2015

More information is provided in Yamamoto's powerpoint presentation, which is posted at <http://www.iodp.org/meeting-presentations?version=2>.

Kroon asked for European hosts for the second SEP of 2015, planned for Europe.

4. The Proposal Review and Advisory Process

4.1 Review Procedures

Kroon and Mallinson presented the review process as follows:

- Review procedures:
 - Highlights from the SEP Terms of Reference
 - General evaluation criteria for IODP proposals and response letters
 - Rating of the proposal (after external review)
 - Characterizing the Site Survey Data
 - Decisions on revised and new proposals from January 2014
 - WD Preparation of Proposal reviews
 - Proposal Evaluation Form
- Evaluation of (possible review result for) revised proposals submitted the 1st of April
- Evaluation of (possible review result for) new proposals submitted the 1st of April

As part of this presentation, Kroon reviewed the following list of proposals, assigned WDs, and Conflicts of Interest (COI)

ID	Title	PI	WD1	WD2	WD3	WD4	WD5	COI
			Science		Site		Operations	
505-Full5	Mariana Convergent Margin	Fryer	Sylvan		Mallinson	Mitchell		
548-Full 3 (Add)	Chicxulub K-T Impact Crater	Morgan	Tarduno	Ildefonse	Burberry		Mclnroy Morgan	Neal, Gulick
708-Full	Central Arctic Paleoceanography	Stein	Romans		Sawyer	Sun, Z.	Mclnroy Morgan	
730-Full	Sabine Bank Sea Level	Taylor	Chase	Hovan	Berne	Pockalny	Mclnroy Morgan	Hornbach Austin
751-Full2 (Add)	West Antarctic Ice Sheet Climate	McKay	Miller	Evangelista	dos Reis	Huuse	Malone	Shevenell
760-Full	SW Australia Margin Cretaceous Climate	Gröcke	Bralower	Sun, W.	Austin	Huuse	LeVay	
777-APL3	Okinawa Trough Qtrny Paleoceanography	Lee	Christensen		Uenzelmann-Neben	Silva	Malone	Ikehara, K.
781A-Full (Add)	Hikurangi: observatory	Saffer	Obana		Pockalny	Uenzelmann-Neben	Klaus	McNeill
793-CPP2 (Add)	Arabian Sea Monsoon	Pandey	Jaccard		Berne	Sawyer	Kulhanek	Clift, Singhvi
795-Full2 (Add)	Indian Monsoon Rainfall	Clemens	Singhvi		Mallinson	Uenzelmann-Neben	LeVay	Clift, Jaiswal
807-Full (Add)	Indonesian Throughflow	Gallagher	Clift		Sawyer	Krastel	Kuhulnek	
830-APL2 (Add)	Scott Plateau microbial interaction	D'Hondt	Heuer		Ikehara, K.	Gorman	Malone	Pockalny
838-CPP2	South China Sea Rifting	Sun, Z.	Tarduno	Ishimaru	Burberry	Gulick	Klaus	Sun
839-Full	Amundsen Sea Ice Sheet history	Gohl	Singhvi	Kroon	Sun	Gorman	Kulhanek	Uenzelmann-Neben
847-Full	Drake Passage paleoenvironment	Weber	Romans	Shevenell	Pockalny	Austin	Klaus	
850-MDP	Transect Drilling During Transits	Thomas	Teske	Koppers	Pandey			
851-Pre	Northwest Atlantic Cenozoic	Lyle	Hovan	Yamamoto, Y.	Hornbach		LeVay	Miller, Tian Wade
852-Pre	North Sea GlaciStore	Stewart	Koppers	McNeill	Jaiswal	Pandey	Eguchi Mclnroy Morgan	
853-Pre	South Atlantic Transect	Coggon	Ildefonse	Wade	Pandey		Klaus	Sylvan
854-Full	Arctic Atlantic Gateway Climate	Geissler	Bahk	Miller	Mitchell	Jaiswal	Kulhanek	
855-Pre	SWIR hydrothermal mineralization	Zhou	Delacour	Pellizari	Austin		Klaus	
856-APL	Proposal 837 Site Survey	McNeill	Obana	Behrman	Mallinson		Malone	Austin, McNeill Gulick
857-MDP	DREAM: Mediterranean Salt Giant	Camerlenghi	Neal	Delacour	Berne		Malone	
857A-Pre	DREAM: Deep-Surface Connection	Rabineau	Behrman	Neal	Burberry	Ikehara, K.	Eguchi	
858-APL	NW Australia Palaeoceanography	Clarke	Jaccard	Wade	dos Reis	Silva	LeVay	
859-Pre	Amazon margin drilling	Baker	Clift	Ikehara	Krastel	Hornbach	LeVay	dos Reis, Silva
860-CPP	Coulman High Paleoclimate	Levy	Evangelista	Jaccard	Silva	Gorman	Mclnroy Morgan	Shevenell Kulhanek
861-Pre	Antarctic Peninsula thermochronometry	Balco	Morishita	Sun, W.	Gulick	Sun, Z.	Mclnroy Morgan	
862-Pre	SW Atlantic Paleogene Climate	Westerhold	Shevenell	Christensen	dos Reis		Kulhanek	
863-MDP	ISOLAT Southern Ocean Paleoclimate	Peterson	Hovan	Chase	Gulick		Mclnroy Morgan	Ikehara, M. Jaccard
864-Pre	Equatorial Atlantic Gateway	Dunkley Jones	Ikehara, M.	Singhvi	Ikehara, K.		Kulhanek	
865-Full	Nankai Trough Temperature Limit	Hinrichs	Takano	Pellizari	Hornbach	Jaiswal	Eguchi	Heuer, Sylvan

- : Came back from external review
- : Revised
- : New
- : Data review only
- Blue : Scheduled

More information is provided in Kroon's powerpoint presentation, which is posted at <http://www.iodp.org/meeting-presentations?version=2>.

5. Review of Proposals

5.1 New Proposals

The SEP began their reviews of the new proposals.

17:15 Meeting Adjourned for the Day

Tuesday	24th of June 2014	08:30-17:30
----------------	--------------------------	--------------------

2.2 Perspectives from the JRFB Chair (Delayed from Monday 23 June)

Susan Humphris, JRFB Chair, reviewed the:

- Role of JOIDES Resolution Facility Board
- Use of Expedited Proposal Reviews
- JR Facility Expedition Schedule
- Expeditions Recommended for Scheduling in FY'16 (and early FY'17)
- Long-Term *JOIDES Resolution* Cruise Track
- *JOIDES Resolution* Facility Board Membership
- Progress toward Science Plan Challenges
 - Climate & Ocean Change
 - Biosphere Frontiers
 - Earth Connections
 - Earth in Motion
- *JR* Facility Board Panels

More information is provided in Humphris's powerpoint presentation, which is posted at <http://www.iodp.org/meeting-presentations?version=2>.

5. Review of Proposals (Continued)

5.1 New Proposals (Continued)

The SEP continued (for the rest of Day 2) their reviews of new proposals.

17:30 Meeting Adjourned for the Day

Wednesday	25th of June 2014	08:30-17:30
------------------	--------------------------	--------------------

5. Review of Proposals (Continued)

5.1 New Proposals (Continued)

The SEP completed their reviews of new proposals.

5.2. Revised Proposals

The SEP completed their reviews of revised proposals.

5.3 External Review Proposals

The SEP completed their reviews of externally reviewed proposals.

5.4 Facility Board Proposals

The assigned WD presented new information provided by the PIs and the SEP began their discussion of the impact of this information to these expeditions.

5. Review of Proposals (Continued)

5.4 FB Proposals (Continued)

The SEP completed discussion of these expeditions.

7. Summary of SEP Reviews

Proposal#	Type	PI	Stage	Platform	Theme	Destination
730	Full	Taylor	SEP	MSP	CO	Revise
751	Add (Full2)	McKay	SEP	JR	CO	Holding Bin
760	Full	Gröcke	SEP	JR	CO	Revise
830	Add (APL2)	D'Hondt	HB	JR	BF	JRFB
838	CPP2	Sun, Z.	SEP	JR	EC	Deactivate
839	Full	Gohl	SEP	JR	CO	JRFB
847	Full	Weber	SEP	JR	CO	Revise
850	MDP	Thomas	SEP	JR	CO	Deactivate
851	Pre	Lyle	SEP	JR	CO	Develop Full
852	Pre	Stewart	SEP	MSP	CO	Develop Full
853	Pre	Coggon	SEP	JR	CO	Develop Full
854	Full	Geissler	SEP	JR	CO	Deactivate
855	Pre	Zhou	SEP	JR	EC	Deactivate
856	APL	McNeill	SEP	JR	EM	Deactivate
857	MDP	Camerlenghi	SEP	Chikyu+JR	BF	Revise
857A	pre	Rabineau	SEP	Chikyu	BF	Develop Full
858	APL	Clarke	SEP	JR	CO	Deactivate
859	Pre	Baker	SEP	JR	CO	Develop Full
860	CPP	Levy	SEP	MSP	CO	Deactivate
861	Pre	Balco	SEP	MSP	CO	Deactivate
862	Pre	Westerhold	SEP	JR	CO	Develop Full
863	MDP	Peterson	SEP	MSP	CO	Revise
864	Pre	Dunkley Jones	SEP	JR	CO	Develop Full
865	Full	Hinrichs	SEP	Chikyu	BF	External review

	: Came back from external review
	: Revised
	: New

Please note: Eight proposals that are already at the Facility Boards appear in the Section 4 table (Proposal Review and Advisory Process). The SSO did not include them in the Summary of SEP reviews table (above) because the appropriate Facility Board makes all decisions regarding these proposals. The associated SEP review reports were sent to the Facility Boards as an aid to their future discussions.

8. Review of Motions and Consensus Items

IODP Forum Chair Becker reported that the ICDP Executive Committee (EC) and Assembly of Governors had endorsed the May 2014 Forum consensus to form an ICDP-IODP working group to design procedures for submission and joint SEP-SAG evaluation of drilling proposals that cross the shoreline. He also noted that the EC had made two nominations to this working group: Pierre Francus from EC and Flavio Anselmetti from SAG. He reported that Jochen Erbacher had volunteered to serve as an IODP Forum representative to the working group and asked for one or two nominations from SEP. Jamie Austin nominated Ken Miller and Sean Gulick, both with relevant prior experience with joint IODP-ICDP proposals, and they agreed to serve.

9. Schedule of Next SEP Meeting

Kroon announced that the next SEP meeting was scheduled for 12-14 January 2015 at Scripps Institution of Oceanography in La Jolla, California, and the 2015 summer SEP meeting was scheduled for 29-30 June to 1 July, at a yet-to-be-selected European location.

Kroon pointed out that to keep these meetings to three days, the first day session of reports from the IODP entities will be issued electronically (prior to the meeting) and the reporting session will be reduced to a brief session for issues, questions, etc. All members agreed to this change in procedure.

Ashok Singvi requested that the group consider moving the January meeting to February. Multiple members state that this would cause them a conflict with their teaching schedules. Mads Huuse requested that meeting start dates be moved to mid-week (rather than Monday), so travel could happen during the week. No action was taken on this request.

10. All Other Business (AOB)

Co-Chief Nominations

Kroon requested that the group provide nominations for the 2016 expeditions:

- Maldives Monsoon (820-Full) with 849-AL
- Indian Ridge Moho (800-MDP)
- SAFARI (720-Full2) with 845-APL
- Sumatra Seismogenesis (837-Full)
- Western Pacific Warm Pool (799-Full)

John Tarduno asked that this not be discussed in a full panel session, as there are too many attendees who are conflicted. Malone reminded everyone that selection of expedition Co-Chiefs was the USIO's responsibility. The SEP agreed to send nominations to science@iodp.org, and Bauer/Yamamoto agreed to compile the nominations and send them to Malone.

Panel Rotations

Kroon reviewed the list of Panel members who will be rotating off this fall, and thanked them for their excellent service.

11:45 Meeting Adjourned